



**NARA
LICENSING
SEMINAR
2020**

**Validation Studies of Licensing Key Indicator
Rules and Risk Assessment Rules: State of
Washington and the Province of
Saskatchewan**

Rick Fiene, Kim Taylor, Derek Pardy, & Sonya Stevens



QRIS Validation Framework (Zellman & Fiene, 2012)

Licensing Validation Framework (Fiene, 2013)

- **Standards Approach:** match jurisdiction's standards/rules to a national or international set of standards acknowledged in the research literature such as Caring for Our Children.
- **Measures Approach:** ascertain if the specific key indicator and/or risk assessment rules are distinguishing between the highly compliant or not.
- **Outputs Approach:** match regulatory compliance with specific rules to a program quality metric, such as the ERS, CLASS, QRIS Standards.
- **Outcomes Approach:** match regulatory compliance to child outcomes, such as injuries or immunization status. Can also be matched to child development outcomes but that might be asking too much.

Validation Framework

Saskatchewan + Washington Studies

SASKATCHEWAN

- Measures Approach: Key Indicators and Risk Assessment Rules.
- Outputs Approach: Future research comparing quality indicators w/regulatory compliance.
- Outcomes Approach: Hazard free environments and Key Indicators regulatory compliance.

WASHINGTON

- Standards Approach: Comparison of Caring for Our Children with WAC Rules.
- Measures Approach: Risk Assessment Matrix and Licensing Decisions.
- Outputs Approach: Regulatory compliance and QRIS/ERS scores comparison.



Province of Saskatchewan, Ministry of Education

- Key Indicators
- Weighted Risk
- Focus Groups
- Eligibility Criteria
- Validation Study
- Quality Indicators
- Pilot Testing
- Full Implementation

State of Washington

- The state has probably the longest history of using the Key Indicator Licensing Approach in the US. Utilized Fiene's 13 Key Indicators as developed from a national study (ASPE, 2002).
- Included a Risk Assessment Matrix (RAM) in order to:
 - Identify enforcement matrix based on single non-compliance findings
 - Identify risk levels of programs with an overall score to inform licensing decisions.
 - Adjust the differential system to become more program specific
- Validation study of the RAM approach in making licensing decisions proved successful with resources being allocated based upon regulatory compliance history and relative rule risk levels which is the essence of a Regulatory Assessment Matrix.

State of Washington: The Process

- 2015 – Aligned WAC (Early Start Act)
- **2016 – Weighting the WAC (Risk Assessment): Survey**
 - **Development of two-tiered enforcement approach**
- 2017 – Negotiated Rule Making
 - **Redesign the Facility Licensing Compliance Agreement (HB 1661)**
- 2017 – Creation of the focused checklist/Field Test
- 2018 – Creation of the Portal System/Pilot
- **2019 – Checklist Implementation and Validation**
- 2020 – Implementation of the enforcement approach

Concluding Thoughts and the Future

- Saskatchewan and Washington join other jurisdictions, such as the states of Georgia, Oregon, and the Province of Ontario in validating portions of their licensing and monitoring systems.
- No jurisdiction has completed all the four approaches to validation to date.
- The most difficult approach to validate is the Outcomes Approach.
- From all the validation studies conducted so far, differential monitoring, through the use of key indicators and risk assessment rules, is clearly a more cost effective and efficient approach to conducting licensing and monitoring reviews based upon these studies.

Saskatchewan and Washington Final Validation Reports

- <https://www.naralicensing.org/key-indicators>
- <https://nara.memberclicks.net/assets/docs/KeyIndicators/Saskatchewan2019-2020/NARA%20SK%20Saskatchewan%20Validation%20Studies.pdf>
- <https://nara.memberclicks.net/assets/docs/KeyIndicators/Washington2020/NARA%20WAVAL%20Final%20Report3.pdf>

Presenters:

THANK YOU



- Rick Fiene, Research Institute for Key Indicators/Penn State University, rjf8@psu.edu or rfiene@rikinstitute.com
- Kim Taylor, Ministry of Education, Province of Saskatchewan
- Derek Pardy, Ministry of Education, Province of Saskatchewan
- Sonya Stevens, Washington Department of Children, Youth, and Families.