



TQRIS VALIDATION: SUMMARY OF RESOURCES

INTRODUCTION

Nearly every state and territory is in the process of planning, piloting, or implementing a tiered Quality Rating and Improvement System (TQRIS) to evaluate the levels of quality of early learning and development programs, inform decision-making to improve the programs, and educate families about the quality of the programs. Additionally, each grantee of the Race to the Top - Early Learning Challenge (RTT-ELC) competition is required to implement a TQRIS.

Many states are also developing TQRIS validation strategies to ensure that program standards accurately reflect differential levels of program quality and to support the effective implementation and ongoing maintenance of the state's early learning and development system. RTT-ELC grantee states are required to submit their TQRIS validation plans to the U.S. Department of Education and the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services for review and comment.

The purpose of this document is to provide a summary of resources that all states and territories may consult for guidance when making decisions with regard to the validation of their TQRIS. These resources include general resources, published reports on QRIS validation best practices, and recent research work conducted in multiple states.

GENERAL RESOURCES LINKS

1. Quality Initiatives Research and Evaluation Consortium ([INQUIRE](#))

- INQUIRE provides information to state administrators and other policymakers and practitioners on evaluation strategies, new research, interpretation of research results, and implications of new research for practice.

2. Office of Planning, Research & Evaluation ([OPRE](#)), an office of the Administration for Children and Families in the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

- The downloadable document titled [Key Elements of a QRIS Validation Plan: Guidance and Planning Template](#) was published in February 2013.

3. Administration for Children and Families in the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

- The downloadable document titled [Quality Rating and Improvement System Resource Guide](#) (refer in particular to section 7, *Data Collection and Evaluation*) is available on the [QRIS Resource Guide page](#).

4. Center on Enhancing Early Learning Outcomes ([CEELO](#))

- The downloadable document titled [Quality Rating Improvement System \(QRIS\) Validation Study Designs](#) was published in July 2013.

PRESENTATIONS

1. REL Mid-Atlantic's Early Childhood Education Research Alliance (ECERA) in collaboration with Quality Initiatives Research and Evaluation Consortium (INQUIRE)

- The webinar titled [Quality Rating and Improvement System Validation Working Group: Meeting 2](#) was delivered on November 6, 2013.
- The webinar titled [Validation of Quality Rating and Improvement Systems](#) was delivered on September 25, 2013.

2. 2013 BUILD QRIS National Meeting

- The presentation titled [The ABC's of Developing a QRIS Evaluation Strategy](#) was delivered on August 2, 2013.
- The presentation titled [QRIS Validation 101](#) was delivered on August 2, 2013.

3. Quality Initiatives Research and Evaluation Consortium (INQUIRE)

- The webinar titled [Validating Quality Rating and Improvement Systems](#) was delivered on March 15, 2012.

4. Mathematica's Center for Improving Research Evidence (CIRE)

- The webinar titled [Effectively Using QRIS Data and Research to Inform Program Design and Management: Sharing New Tools and State Experiences](#) was delivered on November 10, 2011.

PUBLISHED REPORTS

1. Office of Planning, Research & Evaluation (an office of the Administration for Children and Families in the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services)

- The document titled [Validation of Quality Rating and Improvement Systems \(QRIS\): Examples from Four States](#): Research-to-Policy, Research-to-Practice Brief was published in October 2013.
- The document titled [Validation of Quality Rating and Improvement Systems for Early Care and Education and School-Age Care](#) was published in April 2012.
- The document titled [Effective Evaluation of Quality Rating and Improvement Systems for Early Care and Education and School-Age Care](#): Research-to-Policy, Research-to-Practice Brief was published in June 2011.
- The document titled [Evaluation of Quality Rating and Improvement Systems for Early Childhood Programs and School-Age Care: Measuring Children's Development](#): Research-to-Policy, Research-to-Practice Brief was published in June 2011.

-
- The document titled [The Quality Rating and Improvement System \(QRIS\) Evaluation Toolkit](#) was published in August 2011.

2. RAND Corporation

- The document titled [Moving to Outcomes](#) was published in 2012.

STATE TQRIS VALIDATION EXAMPLES

Available state examples are located online at [Communities360](#)^o. From the home page of the GRADS site, scroll down to the Publications section and click “View All.” Then, within the Topic(s) search area, select the topic Validation, which is under the heading Tiered Quality Rating and Improvement Systems (TQRIS). Click the “Filter” button to access the documents.

STATE QRIS VALIDATION RESEARCH

Colorado

Zellman, G.L., Perlman, M., Le, V., & Setodji, C.M. (2008). *Assessing Child Care Quality: How Well Does Colorado’s Qualistar Quality Rating Improvement System Work?* Santa Monica, CA: RAND Corporation. http://www.rand.org/pubs/research_briefs/RB9343.html

Zellman, G.L., Perlman, M., Le, V., & Setodji, C.M. (2008). *Assessing the Validity of the Qualistar Early Learning Quality Rating and Improvement System as a Tool for Improving Child-Care Quality.* (MS-650-QEL). Santa Monica, CA: RAND Corporation. <http://www.rand.org/pubs/monographs/MG650.html>

Indiana

Langill, C., Elicker, J., Ruprecht, K., Kwon, K., & Guenin, J. (January 2009) *Paths to QUALITY—A Child Care Quality Rating & Improvement System for Indiana: Technical Report No. 2, Evaluation Methods and Measures.* West Lafayette, IN: Center for Families, Dept. of Child Development and Family Studies, Purdue University. http://www.cfs.purdue.edu/cff/documents/project_reports/PTQ_TechReport2_Meas.pdf

Elicker, J., Langill, C., Ruprecht, K., & Kwon, K. (2007). *Paths to QUALITY: A Child Care Quality Rating System for Indiana: What is its Scientific Basis?* West Lafayette, IN: Center for Families, Dept. of Child Development and Family Studies, Purdue University. <http://www.in.gov/fssa/files/PurdueValidityReport2007.pdf>

Elicker, J., Langill, C., Ruprecht, K., Lewsader, J., & Anderson, T. (2011). Evaluation of “Paths to QUALITY,” Indiana’s Child Care Quality Rating and Improvement System: Final Report (Technical Report #3). West Lafayette, IN: Center for Family, Dept. of Child Development and Family Studies, Purdue University. http://www.cfs.purdue.edu/cff/documents/project_reports/PTQFinalReportRev11012.pdf or <http://www.researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/22714>



Kentucky

Tout, K., Starr, R., Isner, T., Daily, S., Moodie, S., Rothenberg, L., & Soli, M. (2012). *Executive Summary of the Kentucky STARS for KIDS NOW Process Evaluation*, Evaluation Brief #1. Washington, D.C.: Child Trends. <http://www.kentuckypartnership.org/starsevaluation.aspx>

Massachusetts

Schilder, D., Young, J., Anastasopoulos, L., Kimura, S., & Rivera, B. (2011). *Massachusetts Quality Rating and Improvement System Provisional Standards Study: Final Report*. Boston, MA: Massachusetts Department of Early Education and Care. http://www.eec.state.ma.us/docs1/qris/20110307_ma_qris_provisional_study_summary.pdf

Minnesota

Tout, K., Starr, R., & Cleveland, J. (2008). *Evaluation of Parent Aware: Minnesota's Quality Rating System Pilot: Year 1 Evaluation Report*. Minneapolis, MN: Child Trends.

Tout, K., Starr, R., Isner, T., Cleveland, J., Soil, M., & Quinn, K. (March 2010). *Evaluation of Parent Aware: Minnesota's Quality Rating and Improvement System Pilot: Year 2 Evaluation*. Minneapolis, MN: Child Trends.

Tout, K., Starr, R., Isner, T., Cleveland, J., Soil, M., & Quinn, K. (November 2010). *Evaluation of Parent Aware: Minnesota's Quality Rating and Improvement System Pilot: Year 3 Evaluation*. Minneapolis, MN: Child Trends.

All are available at http://www.pasrmn.org/MELF/Parent_Aware_Pilot_Research.

Missouri

Thornburg, K., Mayfield, W., Hawks, J., & Fuger, K. (October 2009). *The Missouri Quality Rating System School Readiness Study*. Columbia, University of Missouri, Center for Family Policy & Research. <https://mospace.umsystem.edu/xmlui/bitstream/handle/10355/8646/MissouriQualityRatingSystemSchoolReadiness.pdf?sequence=1>

New York

Stephens, S., Kreader, J., Smith, S., McCabe, L. (April 2011). *QualitystarsNY Field Test Evaluation Report*. Columbia University. http://qualitystarsny.org/pdf/QSNY_Field_Test_Full_Evaluation_Report_4-19-11.pdf

North Carolina

Bryant, D. M., Bernier, K., Maxwell, K., & Peisner-Feinberg, E. (2001). *Validating North Carolina's 5-Star child care licensing system*. Chapel Hill, NC: Frank Porter Graham Child Development Center. <http://fpg.unc.edu/resources/validating-north-carolinas-5-star-child-care-licensing-system>

Cassidy, D.J., Hestenes, L.L., Mims, S., & Hestenes, S. (2003). *North Carolina Rated License Assessment Project: An executive summary 1999-2002*. Greensboro, NC: University of North Carolina at Greensboro, North Carolina Rated License Assessment Project.

http://web.uncg.edu/nclap/pdf/ExecutiveSummary_Final_5_15_03.pdf

Cassidy, D.J., Hestenes, L.L., Hegde, A., Mims, S., & Hestenes, S. (2005). Measurement of quality in preschool child care classrooms: An exploratory and confirmatory factor analysis of the Early Childhood Environment Rating Scale—Revised. *Early Childhood Research Quarterly*, 20(3), 345-360. <http://www.uncg.edu/hdf/facultystaff/Cassidy/ECERS%20Manuscript%209-20-04finalrev.pdf>

Cassidy, D.J., Hestenes, L.L., Hestenes, S., & Mims, S. (2003). *Measurement of quality in preschool child care classrooms*. Presentation at the Biennial Meeting of the Society for Research in Child Development.

http://web.uncg.edu/nclap/pdf/Measurement_of_Quality_in_Preschool_Child_Care_Classrooms_SRCD_5_2_03.pdf

Oklahoma

Norris, D.J., Dunn, L., & Eckert, L. (2003). *Reaching for the stars: Center validation study final report*. Norman, OK: Early Childhood Collaborative of Oklahoma.

http://www.okdhs.org/NR/rdonlyres/4C0EF19D-6FC4-40C6-8926-A3371B7F4130/0/ReachingForTheStarsCenterValidationStudyFinalReport_dcc_05212007.pdf

Norris, D.J., & Dunn, L. (2004). *Reaching for the stars: Family child care home validation study: Final Report*. Norman, OK: Early Childhood Collaborative of Oklahoma.

<http://www.oklahomachildcare.org/system/files/ECCO%2520FamilyHome%2520Full%2520Report.pdf>

Pennsylvania

Barnard, W., Smith, W.E., Fiene, R., & Swanson, K. (2006). *Evaluation of Pennsylvania's Keystone STARS Quality Rating System in Child Care Settings*. Pittsburg, PA: University of Pittsburgh, School of Education, Office of Child Development.

<http://www.pakeys.org/docs/Keystone%20STARS%20Evaluation.pdf> or

<http://www.childcareresearch.org/childcare/resources/11429/pdf>

Fiene, R. (April 2006). *Evaluation of Keystone STARS Quality Rating System: Preliminary Results*. Pennsylvania State University. <http://www.harrisburg.psu.edu/sites/default/files/capital-area-early-childhood-training-institute/evaluationofkeystonestarsqualityratingsystem2006preliminaryresults.ppt>

Office of Child Development and Early Learning. (2013, February) *Keystone STARS Technical Assistance (Research Brief, Vol 2, Issue 2)*. Harrisburg, PA.

<http://www.ocdelresearch.org/Research%20Briefs/OCDEL%20Research%20Brief%20February%202013%20Volume%202%20Issue%202.pdf>

Pennsylvania Pre-K Counts. (2010, June) *Keystone STARS: Building a Better, Brighter Future for Pennsylvania*. Harrisburg, PA: Pennsylvania Pre-K Counts.
http://www.pakeys.org/uploadedContent/Docs/STARS_2010_June.pdf

Rhode Island

Maxwell, K. (December, 2008). *Pilot Test of the Draft Rhode Island BrightStars Child Care Center and Preschool Framework*. Chapel Hill, NC: FPG Child Development Institute.
<http://www.rikidscount.org/matriarch/documents/CCC%20Pilot%20Report%202-5-09.pdf>

Tennessee

University of Tennessee College of Social Work, Office of Research and Public Service. (2004, January). *Who cares for Tennessee's Children?* Report prepared for the Tennessee Department of Human Services. <https://www.sworps.tennessee.edu/PDFs/3-2-04STARSSimplex.pdf>

Pope, B.G., Denny, H.H., Homer, K., & Ricci, K. (2006). *What is working? What is not working?: Report on the qualitative study of the Tennessee Report Card and Star-Quality Program and Support System*. Knoxville, TN: University of Tennessee College of Social Work, Office of Research and Public Service. http://www.state.tn.us/humanserv/adfam/rept_insidess.pdf

Washington

Boller, K., Blair, R., Del Grosso, P., & Paulsell, D. (2010, July). *The Seeds to Success Modified Field Study: Impact Evaluation Findings*. Princeton, NJ: Mathematica Policy Research.
http://www.mathematica-mpr.com/publications/PDFs/EarlyChildhood/seeds_to_success_impact.pdf

Boller, K., Del Grosso, P., Blair, R., Jolly, Y., Fortson, K., Paulsell, D., Lundquist, E., Hallgren, K., & Kovac, M. (June 2010). *The Seeds to Success Modified Field Test: Findings from the Impact and Implementation Studies*. Princeton, NJ: Mathematica Policy Research.
http://www.mathematica-mpr.com/publications/PDFs/EarlyChildhood/seeds_to_success_mft.pdf

Del Gross, P., Hallgren, K., Paulsell, D., & Boller, K. (2010, July) *The Seeds to Success Modified Field Test: Implementation Lessons*. Princeton, NJ: Mathematica Policy Research.
http://www.mathematica-mpr.com/publications/PDFs/EarlyChildhood/seeds_to_success_implementation.pdf

Joseph, G.E., Feldman, E.N., Brennan, C., Naslund, R., Phillips, J. & Petras, A. (2011, June) *Seeds to Success Field Test Year Two: Final Technical Report*. Olympia: Washington State, Department of Early Learning. http://www.del.wa.gov/publications/elac-gris/docs/Seeds_to_Success_Final_Evaluation_June_2011.pdf

This resource was developed as part of the Early Learning Challenge TA (ELC TA) program through a contract from the U.S. Department of Education, run in partnership with the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services' Administration for Children and Families. The content does not necessarily reflect the position or policy of the Department of Education or the Department of Health and Human Services, nor does mention or visual representation of trade names, commercial products, or organizations imply endorsement by the federal government. The resources in this document are publicly available resources and their inclusion does not constitute an endorsement by the ELC TA program.