Efficient and Effective Monitoring

Licensing Expert Panel
January 10, 2017
Narrowing Our Focus

- caseload management
- monitoring frequency
- differential monitoring
- standards
- governance
- coordinated monitoring
- licensor support
- transparency
- technology and data
Caseloads
Terminology

- **Caseload** – *Number of programs/providers per licensor*

- **Workload analysis** – *Use of data on programs, activity types, time to conduct activities, and service areas to inform monitoring practices (including caseload distribution)*
CCDF Final Rule

- States must ensure the ratio of inspectors to providers is sufficient to inspect in a timely manner.
Joint Policy Statement

- Based on a statewide assessment of need, establish caseload requirements that take into account the type of ECE program being monitored that accounts for the varying levels of quality, different locations (rural vs. urban), and type of program (center vs. homes).
Caring for Our Children

- Sufficient numbers of licensing inspectors should be hired to provide adequate time visiting and inspecting facilities to ensure compliance with regulations. (Standard 10.4.2.1)
NARA

- Recommends
  - Calculating workload standards to account for local variables
  - Average caseload should not exceed 50-60
    - (Strong Licensing: The Foundation for a Quality Early Care and Education System, 2011)
  - Conducting a licensing workload assessment
    - (Best Practices for Human Care Regulation, 2015)
Trends

- **Average caseload:** 97 centers and homes
  - 103 in 2011

- **Caseloads range from 25 to 300**

  *(2014 Child Care Licensing Study)*
More research needed to determine appropriate caseloads
Resources

◆ Licensing Workload Assessment, NARA, revised 2015

◆ Monitoring Cost Estimation Calculator (including guidance on factors that influence workload), ECQA, 2015

◆ Georgia’s caseload methodology, presented at NARA, 2016
NARA Focus Group

- Caseload determination is complicated, even with a formula
- More guidance and recommendations are needed on setting caseload sizes and how that may interact with the definition of a licensor’s role.
Frequency of Monitoring
Terminology

Monitoring – *Inspections of child care facilities for compliance with rules*
CCDF Final Rule

◆ Requires pre-licensure and annual unannounced visits for all licensed CCDF providers

◆ Requires annual visits for all license-exempt CCDF providers
Caring for Our Children

- Recommends pre-licensure visit and at least two licensing inspections each year, at least one of which should be unannounced.  
  (AAP/APHA/NRC, 2011)
NARA

- Recommends licensing agencies require a minimum inspection frequency of not less than twice a year, including at least one unannounced inspection.
Trends

◆ Pre-licensure
  ▪ All States that license centers and group child care homes conduct a pre-licensure inspection (most of these are announced).
  ▪ 2 States do not inspect FCCH at pre-licensure

◆ Most States conduct *unannounced* inspections for license renewal and other routine compliance visits.

(ECAQ Center, 2015a, b, c)
Trends

Frequency of Routine Compliance Inspections

(ECQA Center, 2015a, b, c)
Research

◆ Gormley, 1999
  ▪ Frequency of inspections and compliance

  • Compliance in family day care homes at inspection and re-inspection
Resources

- *Contemporary Issues in Licensing: Child Care Licensing Inspection Policies*, NCCCQI, 2014

Differential Monitoring
Terminology

◆ Differential Monitoring – Method for determining the frequency/depth of monitoring based on an assessment of a facility’s compliance

◆ Risk Assessment – identifying rules that place children at a greater risk if violations occur

◆ Key Indicators – identifying rules that statistically predict compliance

◆ Abbreviated Checklist – shortened list of requirements that are checked in programs during inspections
CCDF Final Rule

- Requires monitoring to cover health and safety standards and training
- Allows differential monitoring or a risk-based approach
Joint Policy Statement

- Design, implement, and evaluate consistent approaches, including differential monitoring systems to target resources to providers at the greatest risk of providing unsafe settings and to promote greater monitoring efficiencies.
Effective method to improve licensing efficiencies

*(Strong Licensing: The Foundation for a Quality Early Care and Education System, 2011)*
Trends

- More than 25% percent of States use differential monitoring

(ECQA Center, 2015a, b, c)
Trends

70% of States report using abbreviated compliance forms

- Increase from 55% in 2011.
- States chose the rules based on a consensus about rules considered most critical to protecting children’s health and safety and an assessment of risk of harm to children.
- Eight States identified using a set of key indicators

(ECQA Center, 2015a, b, c)
Trends

- 53% have conducted a risk assessment of their licensing requirements
  - About a quarter of the States have assigned a risk level/weight to all requirements.

(ECQA Center, 2015a, b, c)
## Uses of Risk Assessment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Use of Risk Assessment</th>
<th>Percentage of States</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Determining frequency of inspections based on risk level of violations</td>
<td>75%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Determining enforcement actions based on risk level of violations</td>
<td>61%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Categorizing violations</td>
<td>54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monitoring the high risk rules during abbreviated inspections</td>
<td>54%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(ECQA Center, 2015a, b, c)
Research

- Georgia Child Care Licensing Study: Validating the Core Rule Differential Monitoring System, Fiene (2014)
Resources

- Innovation in Monitoring Early Care and Education Settings, Trivedi, 2015
- 13 Indicators of Quality Child Care, Fiene, 2002
Several states are using differential monitoring and want to know more about best practice.

Some find that programs only comply with the abbreviated standards and ignore the remaining standards.
Expert Panel Meeting Take-Aways
Research

- Impact of differential monitoring, use of abbreviated checklists, frequency of visits, announced/unannounced visits, and caseloads on compliance
- Define what we mean by compliance
Data

- More and better data on monitoring tools, non-compliances and national trends
Resources

- Analyzing caseloads
- Steps to implementation
- Provide rationale
Technical Assistance for Licensing Agencies

- Help with implementation
- Help figuring out what data to collect
References


